COMPARISON OF MAIN RESULTS
OF TRACER STUDY
UNIVERSITAS INDONESIA 2010 AND 2011

Ahmad Syafiq and Sandra Fikawati
Career Development Center Universitas Indonesia
a-syafiq@ui.ac.id
Introduction

* Since 2010, Tracer Study Universitas Indonesia (TSUI) has been conducted with specific characteristics:
  * censal (not sampling),
  * self-administered online data collection (no paper and interview),
  * standardized instrument (questionnaire), and
  * regular (implemented yearly)
Introduction

* Number of population:
  - TSUI 2010 was 5276 graduates
  - TSUI 2011 was 5564 graduates
* The number of undelivered cases:
  - TSUI 2010 was 6%
  - TSUI 2011 was 13%
* Response rate:
  - TSUI 2010 was 55% (net)
  - TSUI 2011 was 48%
* Data completeness:
  - TSUI 2010 was 74%
  - TSUI 2011 was 78%
Introduction

* Themes covered in TSUI include socio-biographic aspect, learning experiences, transition to work, employment situation, and competencies and work.

* Selected variables in each theme are presented in this paper.

* Variable selection was based on current issues in higher education especially in Indonesia.

* Due to different questionnaires used in the studies (TSUI 2011 used International Core Questionnaire developed by Unitrace), not all variables could be compared.
Socio-biography

* In term of gender, TSUI 2011 showed that 55% respondents of TSUI 2011 are female.

* There were more female than male in most faculties, except for Faculty Engineering, Faculty of Computer Sciences, Faculty of Law, and Faculty of Economics where male are predominant (76%, 69%, 56%, and 51%, respectively).

* Around 60% of graduates came from Jakarta (capital of Indonesia; UI is located in Depok, in the outskirt of Jakarta), while around 30% came from other places in Java island, 8.8% from Sumatera island, and the rest were from other areas in Indonesia.
Gender

n = 2038
High School Location

- Jakarta: 59.0%
- Jawa: 30.2%
- Sumatera: 8.8%
- Bali & NT: 0.6%
- Kalimantan: 0.5%
- Sulawesi: 0.4%
- Papua: 0.3%
- Maluku: 0.1%

n= 2019
Sociobiography

* Parental education background of TSUI 2011 respondents were mostly high school (for both father and mother, around 30% father and 37% mother), followed by bachelors (28% father, 20% mother).
* Graduates whose parents have low and very low education background (not finished junior high school or lower) were 7% (father) and 9% (mother).
* These figures is important to determine the equality aspect of higher education and the data shown that UI entrance was not limited to those highly educated population.
* However, this is to be compared with situation in other universities in Indonesia before firm conclusion could be drawn.
Fathers’ Education

- Complete high school: 29.9%
- Higher education complete: 27.7%
- Postgraduate complete: 14.1%
- Technical level complete: 11.7%
- Complete junior high school: 5.1%
- Higher education incomplete: 3.5%
- Complete primary school: 2.7%
- Incomplete primary school: 1.7%
- Incomplete high school: 0.9%
- Technical level incomplete: 0.8%
- Incomplete Junior High School: 0.7%
- Postgraduate incomplete: 0.5%
- Do not know: 0.3%
- Without education: 0.2%

n= 2025
Mothers’ Education

- Complete high school: 37%
- Higher education complete: 20%
- Technical level complete: 15%
- Complete junior high school: 8%
- Complete primary school: 6%
- Complete postgraduate: 6%
- Higher education incomplete: 3%
- Incomplete primary school: 2%
- Incomplete high school: 2%
- Incomplete junior high: 1%
- Technical level incomplete: 1%
- Do not know: 0%
- Without education: 0%
- Incomplete postgraduate: 0%

n= 2025
Learning

* Both TSUI 2010 and 2011 respondents stated that regarding learning aspect, emphasis was given more on traditional classical approach such as lectures and discussions, while first hand experiences with real world through apprenticeship, practicum, and research were viewed as less than sufficient.

* This information poses challenges to curricula and learning components development.

* Evaluation should be conducted to elaborate whether the learning in UI is too theoretical and should be more practical oriented.
### Emphasis of Learning Aspects by Study Program

**Not At All** | **Very High**
---|---
1 | 5

- **Lectures**: 4.27
- **Discussions**: 4.01
- **Demonstrations**: 3.30
- **Practical exercises/Field work**: 3.23
- **Participation in research projects/project based**: 2.96
- **Internship**: 2.82

*Sample sizes:*
- Lectures: 2077
- Discussions: 2010
- Demonstrations: 2000
- Practical exercises/Field work: 2008
- Participation in research projects/project based: 2005
- Internship: 2016
Employability

* One of main indicators of graduate employability is the duration of job search period.

* Both TSUI 2010 and TSUI 2011 showed that for UI graduates in general; the median of job search duration was 3 months. There were variations and differences among faculties by year.
  - Consistently, Faculties of Medicine, Dentistry, and Computer Sciences have the shortest duration of 1 month in both studies.

* It is noted that both studies reveal:
  - Internet is the main method of job searching, this reflects the importance of information technology in today generation.
  - Other popular methods of job search include:
    - Information from career center at university and faculty level,
    - Advertisement in newspaper or magazine, and
    - Connection through family, friend, and or lecturer.
Job Search Duration (Median-Month)

n 2010 = 1416
n 2011 = 1317

- TSUI 2010
- TSUI 2011
Job Searching Methods

- I checked through the internet/on line/mailing list advertisement: 77% (TSUI 2010), 74% (TSUI 2011)
- Advertisement in newspaper/magazine, fliers: 57% (TSUI 2010), 60% (TSUI 2011)
- I went to a job fair: 51% (TSUI 2010), 53% (TSUI 2011)
- Relations (e.g. parents, relatives, friends, etc.): 48% (TSUI 2010), 41% (TSUI 2011)
- I had information from Career Development Center: 35% (TSUI 2010), 41% (TSUI 2011)
- I established a networking since I was in the higher education institution: 22% (TSUI 2010), 22% (TSUI 2011)
- Contacting companies without checking for vacancies: 22% (TSUI 2010)
- I was contacted by the company: 19% (TSUI 2010)
- Work placement/internship during study time: 8% (TSUI 2010)
- I contacted the office of student/alumni affairs: 6% (TSUI 2010)
- I established my own business: 6% (TSUI 2010)

Others: incl. I contacted the state working agency, I contacted a commercial working agency
Employability

* The pattern of employability was almost similar but self-employed increased slightly.
  - Private institutions (TSUI 2010 65.0%, TSUI 2011 60.9%),
  - Government institutions (TSUI 31.9%, TSUI 2011 33.6%)
  - Self-employed (TSUI 2010 3.1%, TSUI 2011 5.5%).

* Work challenge (around 35%) is the main consideration in choosing the first job, followed by salary (30%) and other benefits.
Type of Current Employer

- Public Employer
  - 2010: 32%
  - 2011: 35%

- Private Employer
  - 2010: 65%
  - 2011: 60%

- Self Employer
  - 2010: 3%
  - 2011: 5%

n 2010 = 1618
n 2011 = 1841
Main Consideration to Select Job

- Challenges in the job: 33.9%
- Salary: 30.3%
- Proximity to house: 6.5%
- Scholarship opportunity: 6.2%
- Experience: 5.2%
- Benefits: 4.6%
- Matchness with discipline: 4.5%
- Others: 4.2%
- Interest: 3.2%
- Company reputation: 1.5%

n= 1379
Competencies

* Regarding acquired and required competencies, most respondents had a positive perception (positive gap) for most of competencies, meaning that they acquired more than the requirements in their work.
* The closest gaps between acquirement and requirement were for skills beyond cognition such as communication and negotiating skills.
* The only negative gap was found for research competence.
* The results pointed to the importance of other key skills needed by students as to survive in the world after higher education.
Competencies (1)

- Knowledge of your field(s) or discipline(s)
- Knowledge of other field(s) or discipline(s)
- General knowledge
- Internet skills
- Computer skills
- Critical thinking
- Research skills
- Learning ability
- Communication skills
- Working under pressure

Competencies after Graduation  
Application in World of Work
Competencies after Graduation and Application in the World of Work

- Time management
- Working independently
- Team work ability
- Problem-solving ability
- Negotiation
- Analytical ability
- Tolerance
- Adaptability
- Loyalty and integrity
- Working with people of different cultures and backgrounds
- Application in World of Work

1 Very low
2
3
4
5 Very high

Competencies after Graduation
Application in World of Work
Leadership

Responsibility

Initiative

Project/program management

Ability to present ideas and information

Ability to write reports and documents

Ability to continuously learn

Competencies after Graduation Application in World of Work

Very low

Very high

1 2 3 4 5

Leadership

Responsibility

Initiative

Project/program management

Ability to write reports and documents

Ability to present ideas and information

Ability to continuously learn

Competencies after Graduation Application in World of Work

Very low

Very high

1 2 3 4 5
Link and Match

* Link and match indicators of horizontal and vertical matches among respondents in both studies are close to expectation
* Horizontal matches were 20% in TSUI 2010 and 16% in TSUI 2011,
* Vertical matches were over qualification of 6.6% in TSUI 2010 and 5.3% in TSUI 2011
Horizontal Mismatch

n\text{2010} = 1752
n\text{2011} = 858
Vertical Mismatch

Under Education

- 2010: 27.6%
- 2011: 29.4%

Matched

- 2010: 65.8%
- 2011: 65.3%

Over Education

- 2010: 6.6%
- 2011: 5.3%

n 2010 = 1762
n 2011 = 1513
The most horizontally matched is faculties in the health sciences cluster (Faculties of Medicine, Dentistry, Public Health, Nursing, Pharmacy Study Program)

Followed by faculties within science and technology cluster (Faculties of Engineering, Computer Sciences, and Mathematics and Natural Sciences), and

Then faculties in social-humanities cluster (Faculties of Social and Political Sciences, Economics, Law, Psychology, and Humanities).

The interpretation of match should be taken carefully due to different nature of different discipline and their closeness to the profession.
Horizontal Mismatch Based on Cluster

n 2010 = 1752
n 2011 = 1527

25.3% 15.9% 7.4% 18.5% 15.2% 9.6% 0% 10% 20% 30% 40% 50% 60% 70% 80% 90% 100%

Humanities Science Technology Health

TSUI 2010 TSUI 2011
Conclusion

- TSUI 2010 is better than TSUI 2011 in terms of undelivered rate and response rate, but TSUI 2011 is better in terms of data completion.
- TSUI 2010 and TSUI 2011 are indifferent for variables related to learning process and transition to employment, i.e. learning aspect emphasis, job search duration, method to find job, type of employer, and acquired and required competencies.
- Regarding link and match, TSUI 2011 shows better matching than TSUI 2010 both horizontally and vertically.
- Overall, for the selected variables, TSUI 2010 and 2011 results are consistent and the results provide an optimistic promise for UI graduates.
Thank You Very Much for your kind attention